

Reading the Future? : Legal and Ethical Challenges Of Predictive Genetic Testing

Trudo Lemmens
Mireille Lacroix
Roxanne Mykitiuk

With contributions by :
Lisa Austin and Bitu Amani

On peut se procurer le présent ouvrage à:

Les Éditions Thémis
Faculté de droit, Université de Montréal
C.P. 6128, Succ. Centre-Ville
Montréal (Québec) H3C 3J7
Canada

Courriel : themis@droit.umontreal.ca
Internet : www.themis.umontreal.ca
Téléphone : (514) 343-6627
Télécopieur : (514) 343-6779

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ix
Preface	xi
1. Toward a Process of Dealing with Ethical and Regulatory Issues of New Predictive Genetic Technology	1
1.1 Why Does Genetic Information Merit Special Attention?.....	1
1.2 Assessing the Value of Genetic Information.....	3
1.3 Assumptions.....	6
2. Genetic Discrimination and Stigmatization	9
2.1 Introduction.....	9
2.1.1 Genetic Traits and Enumerated Grounds	12
2.1.1.1 Disability or Handicap?	12
2.1.1.2 Other Prohibited Grounds of Discrimination....	15
2.1.2 Bona Fide Justifications of Discrimination and Genetics	17
2.1.3 A New Enumerated Ground of Discrimination?.....	20
2.1.4 Limits of Existing Human Rights Protection	23
2.1.5 Recommendations.....	27
2.2 Genetic Discrimination and Insurance	28
2.2.1 The Social Importance of Insurance.....	29
2.2.2 Current Legal Framework	36
2.2.3 A New Regulatory Structure.....	43
2.2.4 Recommendations.....	45
2.3 Employment.....	46
2.3.1 Forms and Purposes of Genetic Testing.....	47
2.3.1.1 Identifying Individuals Who Have an Increased Susceptibility to Occupational Disease	49
2.3.1.2 Testing in Order to Determine if an Individual Could Present a Risk to the Safety of Other Employees or the Public	50

2.3.1.3	Identifying Individuals Who are at a Greater Risk of Developing Genetic Conditions Regardless of their Work Environment.....	53
2.3.1.4	Identifying Individuals Who Have a Specific Work-related Quality or Trait	55
2.3.2	International Perspectives.....	56
2.3.3	The Legal Framework	59
2.3.4	A New Regulatory Structure	64
2.3.5	Recommendations	66
2.4	Financial Institutions	67
2.4.1	Genetic Information and Access to Financial Services ..	67
2.4.2	Recommendations	69
2.5	Adoption.....	69
2.5.1	Testing of the Prospective Adoptee.....	70
2.5.2	Testing of Prospective Adopting Parents	73
2.5.3	Recommendations	74
2.6	Genetic Testing and Education.....	74
2.6.1	The Potential Use of Genetic Testing in Education.....	74
2.6.2	Recommendations	77
2.7	Health Services.....	77
2.7.1	Genetic Information as a Potential Factor in Access to Health Services.....	77
2.7.2	Recommendations	78
3.	The Regulation of Research.....	81
3.1	Research Regulation in Canada: A System of Guidelines.....	81
3.1.1	Research Ethics Boards	83
3.1.2	Federally Funded Research	89
3.1.3	Privately Funded Research.....	90
3.1.4	Research Funded by the National Institutes of Health ...	91
3.1.5	Research Funded by Provincial Governments.....	92
3.1.6	Lack of Regulatory Supervision.....	94
3.2	Recommendations	98

4. Access to Genetic Services	99
4.1 Health Care Services and the <i>Canada Health Act</i>	99
4.2 Genetic Services and Our Health Care System.....	101
4.3 Recommendations.....	104
5. Patents on Genes: Identifying Issues and Responses	105
By <i>Lisa M. AUSTIN and Bitu AMANI</i>	
5.1 Overview.....	105
5.2 Ethical and Policy Considerations	107
5.3 Canada's Domestic Patent Law	108
5.3.1 What is a Patent?.....	108
5.3.2 Why Grant a Patent?	108
5.3.3 Why Grant Patents in the Context of Biomedical Research?	110
5.3.4 Requirements for Validity.....	113
5.3.5 Using Another's Invention.....	119
5.4 Related Justice Concerns	124
5.5 Canada's International Obligations.....	125
5.5.1 TRIPS: Brief Introduction to Multilateral System	125
5.5.1.1 Biotech Patents: The General Rule	127
5.5.1.2 Permissible Patent Exemptions.....	128
5.5.2 NAFTA	132
5.5.2.1 What is Patentable?.....	132
5.5.2.2 Exclusions from Patentability	132
5.5.3 NAFTA and TRIPS Implications: Canada's Recourse ...	134
5.5.3.1 Patent Challenge or Revocation.....	134
5.5.3.2 Compulsory Licensing.....	135
5.5.4 Infringement Actions	137
5.6 Conclusions.....	137
5.7 Recommendations.....	139
6. Commercialization and Direct Marketing of Genetic Testing	141
6.1 Commercialization and Direct Marketing.....	141
6.1.1 Commercialization and Consumer-Patient Protection	142

6.1.2	Commercialization and Genetic Counselling	146
6.1.3	The Availability of Commercial Testing.....	147
6.2	Recommendations	149
7.	Regulation and Liability of Genetic Counsellors	151
7.1	Genetic Counselling – An Important Part of Genetic Services .	151
7.2	Professional Regulation.....	154
7.3	The Regulation of Genetic Counsellors	156
7.4	Recommendations	159
8.	Clinical Issues	161
8.1	Consent to Testing.....	161
8.1.1	Informed Consent.....	161
8.1.2	Express Consent	166
8.1.3	Specific Consent Issues	170
8.1.3.1	Multiplex Testing.....	170
8.1.3.2	Pleitropic Information.....	174
8.1.4	Recommendations	174
8.2	Disclosure of Results.....	175
8.2.1	Unexpected Findings.....	175
8.2.2	The Right Not to Know	177
8.2.3	Recommendations	180
8.3	Privacy and Confidentiality of Genetic Information	180
8.3.1	The Duty of Confidentiality of Health Care Providers...	181
8.3.2	Distinction Between Genetic Information and Other Forms of Health Information.....	189
8.3.3	Defining the Patient.....	193
8.3.4	Duty of Disclosure.....	194
8.3.4.1	Guidelines	200
8.3.5	Deceased Individuals.....	203
8.3.5.1	Access to Test Results.....	204
8.3.5.2	Requests for Post-mortem Testing	205
8.3.5.3	Non-medical Testing.....	206
8.3.6	Recommendations	207

8.4 Genetic Testing of Minors	207
8.4.1 Newborn Screening.....	208
8.4.2 Predictive Genetic Testing of Children.....	213
8.4.3 Adolescents and Mature Minors	218
8.4.4 Disclosure of Test Results.....	219
8.4.5 Recommendations.....	220
8.5 Genetic Testing of Incapable Persons and Persons with Reduced Capacity	221
8.5.1 Incapable Persons.....	221
8.5.2 Adults with Reduced Capacity to Consent.....	222
8.5.3 Recommendations.....	223
9. Storage of Genetic Material and Information	225
9.1 Genetic Information and Medical Records	225
9.2 Genetic and Tissue Banks	227
9.3 Ownership of Samples and Test Results	233
9.3.1 Policy Considerations	238
9.4 Uses of Stored Genetic Material and Genetic Information	242
9.5 Withdrawal of Consent	247
9.6 Length of Storage Period	249
9.7 Access of Family Members to Stored Samples and Information	251
9.8 Re-contacting Patients and Family Members.....	252
9.9 Recommendations.....	255
10. Conclusion	257
11. Summary of Recommendations	267
Works Cited.....	277
About the Contributors	307