

**'Imperilled' Newborns: A Duty to Treat?  
From personhood to best interests**

**Thierry HURLIMANN**

Table des matières

On peut se procurer le présent ouvrage à:

Les Éditions Thémis  
Faculté de droit, Université de Montréal  
C.P. 6128, Succ. Centre-Ville  
Montréal (Québec) H3C 3J7  
Canada

Courriel : [themis@droit.umontreal.ca](mailto:themis@droit.umontreal.ca)

Internet : [www.themis.umontreal.ca](http://www.themis.umontreal.ca)

Téléphone : (514) 343-6627

Télécopieur : (514) 343-6779

## Table of contents

---

Acknowledgements .....	xi
Introduction .....	1
<b>PART I - THE ETHICAL STATUS OF IMPERILLED NEONATES</b> .....	<b>11</b>
Chapter 1 - The implications of “moral personhood” .....	11
Chapter 2 - Overview of extreme positions .....	14
Chapter 3 - Beyond strict personhood.....	21
Chapter 4 - The personhood of neonates in the light of professional ethical guidelines .....	26
4.1 Overview .....	26
4.2 The puzzling French approach .....	28
Chapter 5 - The practical impact of considerations pertaining to moral personhood .....	30
<b>PART II - LEGAL PERSONHOOD</b> .....	<b>37</b>
Chapter 1 - Legal personhood: an evolving concept with evolving implications .....	37
Chapter 2 - The legal status of the foetus .....	40
2.1 Canada.....	40
2.1.1 Canadian common law and civil law of Quebec .....	40
2.1.2 Abortion regulations .....	43
2.1.3 Criminal law .....	44
2.2 United States .....	46
2.2.1 Common law .....	46
2.2.2 Abortion regulations .....	48
2.2.3 Criminal laws.....	49
2.2.4 The American trend.....	51
Chapter 3 - The born alive and viable rule: a real maze .....	52
3.1 Confusing discrepancies between the states and different bodies of law .....	52

3.2	What constitutes “live-birth” and “viability”?	53
3.2.1	Live-birth	53
3.2.2	Viability	59
3.3	Consequences	65
Chapter 4 - The legal personhood of imperilled neonates		
		66
4.1	Challenging grounds	66
4.2	Canada	68
4.2.1	Civil law of Quebec	68
4.2.2	Common law	73
4.2.3	Criminal law	76
4.2.4	Summary of the Canadian perspective	82
4.3	United States	82
4.3.1	The background	83
4.3.2	The case of anencephalic infants	87
4.3.3	Live births from late abortions & the Born-Alive Infants Protection Act	93
4.3.4	U.S. law and infanticide	96
4.3.5	A strong recognition of legal personhood with significant implications	97
Chapter 5 - The global picture of legal personhood: coping with ambiguity		
		102
<b>PART III - THE POTENTIAL IMPACT OF MORAL PERSONHOOD ON THE “BEST INTERESTS” ANALYSIS</b>		
		105
Chapter 1 - The duty to treat neonates in their best interests		
		106
1.1	Limitations of parental authority	106
1.2	Best interests & Substituted Judgement	108
1.3	Sanctity of life and Quality of life	110
Chapter 2 - “Quality of life” considerations		
		116
2.1	Quality of life and commentators	116
2.2	Quality of life and the courts	119

2.2.1 United States.....	119
2.2.2 Canada.....	120
Chapter 3 - Moral personhood and best interests of imperilled neonates.....	123
3.1. Similar but not identical perspectives .....	124
3.2. From theory to practice .....	129
3.2.1 The impact of social and personal perceptions towards disability.....	132
3.2.2. The impact of the neonatal context.....	133
3.3. Puzzling examples of best interests analysis.....	135
Conclusion .....	141
Bibliography .....	145